ASSESSING CANADA'S SUPPORT OF INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS:

A COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF CANADA'S RETENTION AND SETTLEMENT OF ITS "MODEL IMMIGRANTS"

by

Zaheer A. Dauwer, B.Ed., York University, 2012; MA, University of Arizona, 2009

A Major Research Paper presented to Ryerson University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts
in the Program of

Immigration and Settlement Studies

Toronto, Ontario, Canada, 2018

AUTHOR'S DECLARATION FOR ELECTRONIC SUBMISSION OF A MRP

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this Major Research Paper. This is a true copy of the MRP, including any required final revisions, as accepted by my examiners.

I authorize Ryerson University to lend this MRP to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research

I further authorize Ryerson University to reproduce this MRP by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

I understand that my MRP may be made electronically available to the public.

Zaheer A. Dauwer

Assessing Canada's Support of International Students: A Comprehensive Review of Canada's Retention and Settlement of its "Model Immigrants"

Zaheer A. Dauwer 2018

Master of Arts in Immigration and Settlement Studies

Ryerson University

ABSTRACT

The unprecedented growth in the number of international students in Canada over the last decade has drawn the attention of policy makers at all levels of government in Canada. The federal, provincial and territorial levels of government have introduced permanent residency pathways to encourage international students to become permanent residents of Canada. International students are an attractive group as prospective immigrants because of their Canadian education and human capital. However, they experience variety of challenges transitioning to employment and permanent residency in Canada. Lack of limited co-operative education opportunities and labor market preparation hinders the process of finding employment while the absence of settlement services and the complexities of immigration policies complicate the process of seeking permanent residency in Canada. These realities hold significant policy implications for the federal and provincial levels of government because Canada continues to admit educated and skilled labor in order to address labor and demographic needs.

Key words: socioeconomic integration, human capital, internationalization, transitional barriers, recruitment and retention.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I would like to acknowledge the dedication and guidance of my supervisor, Dr. Arthur Ross. Working with him reinforced my passion for immigration issues and polices. I am particularly grateful for his detailed and constructive feedback throughout the process of writing this major research paper.

I would also like to thank Dr. Myer Siemiatycki for his feedback as my second reader and for his extraordinarily kind and encouraging words during this process.

Finally, I would like to recognize the unconditional love and support of my wife, Zohra and my children Hasti and Sulaiman. Your love and support sustained me through this time and your presence in my life was a constant reminder of why I was in this program.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Research Context and Methodology

This research paper presents the findings of an extensive literature review related to the employment and immigration experiences of international students who participate in the two-step immigration process in Canada. International students experience variety of challenges transitioning to employment and permanent residency in Canada. Those who wish to temporarily work in Canada have difficulty finding employment because of limited co-operative education opportunities and a lack of professional networks. The lack of settlement services, the numerous complexities of immigration policies, and minimal awareness among students about of employment and immigration procedures hinders the process of becoming permanent residents of Canada. These realities hold significant policy implications for the federal and provincial levels of government because Canada continues to admit educated and skilled labor in order to address labor and demographic needs. Although not all international students intend to stay in Canada to pursue employment or permanent residency, the trend of the past fifteen years points to a consistent increase in the number of students who intend to work and become permanent residents. International students, especially those who hope to pursue employment and permanent residency in Canada, are an attractive population because of Canadian education and human capital they acquire upon completion of their studies. Moreover, international students' positive impact on the Canadian economy, education and society has been significant.

The purpose of this study is to evaluate the current state of research related to international students' experiences of transition to employment and permanent residency in Canada. This research study highlights the barriers international students experience and

its negative impact on their settlement in Canada. This research study also examines the settlement support international students need to participate in employment programs and in seeking permanent residency in Canada. Finally, this research highlights the implications of their long-term integration into the Canadian society.

This research topic holds both personal and academic interest for me. The topic is comparatively under-researched due to the relatively recent development of retention polices in Canada that targets international students. This research is critically important because of the implications for successful integration are serious and long-term. Additionally, I am personally interested in this topic. I was an international student for two years in the United States studying for my graduate degree in teaching English. I relate to the personal and academic struggles of international students in Canada.

Research Methodology

This research paper is a qualitative research study. A qualitative research approach facilitates an in-depth and "detailed understanding of an issue" (Creswell, 2007, p.40). Creswell recommends the use of qualitative research when studying a group or to "identify variables that can be measured" (2007, p.40). Creswell offers the most current definition of qualitative research by quoting Deniz and Lincoln, who maintain that "qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible" (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p. 3 quoted in Creswell, 2007, p. 36). "This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them" (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p. 3 quoted in Creswell, 2007, p. 36).

This study utilizes qualitative research methods by undertaking an integrative literature review. Integrative literature review is a qualitative approach that provides the most appropriate research method for this study. As the researcher, I made a methodological assumption that an extensive literature review of current research allows an in-depth examination of the barriers international students experience when they transition to employment and permanent residency. A literature review is "a critical summary of research on a topic of interest often prepared to put a research problem in context" (Russell, 2005, p.9). The integrative literature review is "the process of systematically analyzing and summarizing the research literature" for the purpose of presenting the current state of research on a given topic (Russell, 2005, p.9). According to Russell (2005), an integrative literature review should "begin by defining the purpose, the problem and the research questions under study" and it should specify the "concepts" that will be studied (p.10). The choice of integrative literature review as the research methodology adds considerable strength to this research study.

This literature review draws out a deeper understanding of barriers international students experience in seeking employment and permanent residency. Topics explored through this qualitative study include barriers during the transition from study to work and work to permanent residency as well as settlement services required to assist international students during the transition phases. This literature review is integrative in nature as it provides the context related to employment programs and immigration pathways offered to international students in Canada. This research study also examines the increasing settlement needs of international students and the inadequacies of services.

Over the last decade, there has been significant growth in the number of international students seeking employment and permanent residency in Canada. However, international student offices do not receive sufficient funding and staff to meet the needs of international students. Significantly, there is limited research about how international student offices are coping with the considerable increase in the nature and complexity of services they are expected to provide to international students. In order to understand this challenge, I met with three international student advisors from three different universities in Ontario to learn about their experiences and challenges. These interviews broadened my understanding of the current issues and challenges faced by international student offices. The interviews were informal and not attributable to any specific interviewee or university.

Theories: Segmented Assimilation and Social Inclusion

Segmented assimilation theory informs the analysis of this research paper. This theory holds that the assimilation process varies among immigrant groups and it largely depends on "influences of larger social environment and individual group adaptations and behaviors" (Lee, 2009, p.732). The segmented assimilation theory is built on the classical assimilation theory that considers assimilation to be a set of "social processes that brings ethnic minorities into the mainstream" (Lee, 2009, p.732). Under the classical assimilation theory, the concept of integration is held to be "linear, with one clear path and outcome" and the immigrants' culture and language are seen as "shortcomings" while lack of familiarity with host society's culture and language is seen as "deficits" to full assimilation (Lee, 2009, p.732). In order to analyze the integration experiences of immigrants, Lee (2009) argues that traditional assimilation theories such as the classical assimilation theory are "weak and ineffectual in explaining the persistence of inequality" experienced by immigrants (p.732).

Furthermore, a single pathway to assimilation does not take into account the "diverse characteristics of immigrant groups and their social context (Lee, 2009, p.732).

Segmented assimilation theory was developed in the United States around 1980s to study the experiences of non-European immigrants who experienced difficulties entering the labor market in the United States (Lee, 2009). Social factors influencing their experiences included difficulties with cultural adaptation, learning English, racism and discrimination and lack of recognition for their foreign qualifications. The segmented assimilation theory is an appropriate theory to examine labor market experiences of international students in Canada because their experiences are similar to non-European immigrants in the United States in the 1980s because they are predominantly from non-European countries.

Courtney Cox argues that social inclusion is an appropriate lens to study international students in Canada because "as temporary migrants, international students are excluded from services and rights granted to those with formal, permanent status, or citizenship" (2014, p.19). The social inclusion approach offers a "platform to assess not just policies, or outcomes, but widens the viewpoint to include individuals and communities who influence and are influenced by the aforementioned", which includes international students and all the stakeholders (Cox, 2014, p.19). Saloojee (2003) defines social inclusion as:

> Social inclusion is about social cohesion plus, it is about citizenship plus, it is about the removal of barriers plus, it is anti-essentialist plus, it is about rights and responsibilities plus, it is about accommodation of differences plus, it is about democracy plus, it is about a new way of thinking about the problems of injustice, inequalities and exclusion (p. 14).

For the purpose of this research, *successful labor-market integration* is defined as securing paid skilled employment that qualifies international students for permanent residency. *Segmented labor-market integration* is when students are underemployed or employed in skilled occupations unrelated to their education, which qualify for permanent residency. *Unsuccessful labor-market integration* is when students are employed in occupations that do not qualify for permanent residency. For the purpose of this research *social inclusion* is defined in terms of exclusion of international students from services, programs and employment opportunities on the basis of their temporary status, language skills, lack of Canadian work experience, and foreign qualification.

Research Questions and Themes

This research was guided by the following questions: What are the barriers reported in the literature related to international students' transition from study-to-work and work-to-permanent residency in Canada? What type of settlement support would facilitate their successful transition from study-to-work and work-to-permanent residency in Canada? The research questions limit the focus of this research study to barriers international students experience when they seek employment and permanent residency. This meant that only research literature focusing on challenges of seeking employment and permanent residency were included in this research study and those focusing on other challenges unrelated to employment and permanent residency were excluded.

The literature review for this research study found variety of different themes related to barriers international students experience in Canada. However, the selection of themes was limited to those directly related to experiences of transition to employment and permanent residency. In other words, if a barrier reported in the literature did not impact

international students' transition to employment or permanent residency, it was eliminated from consideration. The themes examined in this research study directly influenced transitional experiences of students. The first broad theme is the lack of employment preparation and obstacles to labour market integration. This theme incorporates three related themes: 1) real and perceived barriers to enter labor market; 2) limited work placement opportunities and lack of employment preparation, and 3) minimal professional networks. The second theme is limitations of services offered by offices serving international students. The third theme is complexities of employment and immigration procedures and international students' lack of awareness of employment and immigration procedures. The fourth and final theme is social inclusion and cultural adaptation. Themes that fell outside the scope of this research include language difficulties, loneliness and depression experienced by international students.

The term *international student* in this research study refers to students from other countries studying in the undergraduate or graduate programs in post-secondary institutions (trades schools, colleges and universities) in Canada. It does not include foreign students studying in elementary and secondary schools. The undergraduate and graduate students share some similarities and differences. Undergraduate students are mostly younger with limited life experience while graduate students usually have more life experience having completed an undergraduate degree often in Canada. Undergraduate students often have limited work experience while graduate students usually have some work experience and as graduate students, they also work as teaching and research assistant during their studies. Consequently, graduate students often do not experience difficulty securing employment compared to undergraduate students. Under different provincial

nominee programs, graduate students qualify for permanent residency without accumulating one year of skilled work experience. This places graduate students at an advantage over undergraduate students.

This research study is organized in four chapters. Chapter one provides the context for the development of employment programs and immigration pathways targeting international students. Chapter two presents the findings of an extensive literature review about transition difficulties and barriers international students experience when seeking employment and permanent residency in Canada. The research literature includes the experiences of diverse group of students from all levels of study, nationalities and gender studying in different regions of Canada. Chapter three reviews the research literature on settlement and integration and discusses several best practices and policy suggestions to address the transition challenges. Chapter four offers practical recommendations that are informed by research and grounded on evidence-based results.

CHAPTER I

Internationalization, Recruitment and Retention Policies

This chapter examines the historical context of the development of recruitment and retention policies targeting international students in Canada. The retention of international students as skilled labor immigrants contributes to the economic prosperity of Canada by helping foreign students acquire work experience and permanent resident status in Canada. Since the formation of the nation state in 1867, Canada's immigration policies have been in most part focused on promoting the country's economic prosperity. Since then, Canada has turned to immigration in order to address national priorities such as labor shortage,

replacing an aging population and a declining birthrate. This chapter also reviews the internationalization of higher education and the rise in the recruitment of international students among Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) countries. Finally, the chapter discusses the introduction of employment programs and permanent residency pathways designed to retain international students in Canada.

The three main stakeholders pertaining to international students in Canada are the federal, provincial/territorial levels of government and post-secondary institutions; each have unique roles with both shared and diverse objectives. The federal level of government and mainly Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (IRCC) is responsible for developing selection criteria for both temporary and permanent residency. This federal department is also responsible for issuing work permits and programs for labor market integration. The provincial and territorial levels of government are responsible for recruitment and retention strategies and the management of education system in their jurisdictions. The provincial and territorial governments also nominate international students for permanent residency under the provincial nominee programs. The post-secondary institutions admit and enroll international students for study and offer support services to assist students during their study. In addition, post-secondary institutions also assist international students applying for Off-Campus Work Permit and Post-Graduate Work Permit.

Immigration and Economic Prosperity

The unprecedented growth in the number of international students in Canada over the last decade and a half has in recent years drawn the attention of policy makers at all levels of government in Canada. The total number of international students present in

Canada in 2017 was the highest it has ever been 494,525 according to CBIE (2018). The federal, provincial and territorial levels of government have introduced permanent residency pathways to allow international students to acquire permanent resident status in Canada. Starting in 2005, Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (IRCC), the federal department responsible for immigration and citizenship expanded employment programs to allow international students to acquire work experience during and after their studies. There has been significant interest among international students in Canada in participating in employment programs. The number of students who intend to become permanent residents has also been on the rise. Canada has earned a reputation that is a prime destination for higher education, a leading immigrant receiving nation regarded as uniquely multicultural with fair and open immigration policies. Canada emerged as an immigrant receiving nation in large part due to its reliance on immigration to address labor and demographic needs, but also due to the country's reputation as a nation that upholds its international commitments to resettlement of refugees on humanitarian basis and respects human rights.

As Canada began to take shape after 1867, the nation turned to immigration from Europe to build a country that was "thinly populated" and "economically fragile" (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010, p.61). Therefore, immigration policies were designed to admit immigrants in order to increase the population and achieve economic prosperity. Since then, Canada has continued to address population growth through immigration in addition to other national priorities such as meeting labor market needs and revitalizing regional economies (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010). Therefore, economic interests have consistently dictated immigration policies in Canada. As a result, the potential economic contribution of new immigrants

continues to shape admission policies. Kelley and Trebilcock (2010) cite the immigration policy enacted during 1869, which emphasized the admission of immigrants with agriculture experience who were able to work and restricted admission of those "unable to support themselves upon arrival" and those with "physical disability or criminal tendencies" (p.64). Admission policies have since then placed greater emphasis on the human capital (education, skill and work experience) considered important for successful employment.

In addition to economic goals, preserving Canada's national identity as a white "homogenous society based on British values, traditions and institutions" also influenced immigration policies (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010, p.13). In order to preserve its national identity, Canada adopted exclusionary and discriminatory policies (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010). By 1960s, the nation was willing to turn away from an admission policy "that was uncomfortably focused on race, religion and ethnicity" (Anwar, 2014, p. 170). However, with regulatory reforms of 1962 and 1967 Canada adopted "racially neutral selection criteria" (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010, p.357). Finally, the Immigration Reform Act of 1976 introduced changes that received "unanimous support" from the Canadian public (Kelley & Trebilcock 2010, p.379). These reforms marked a new chapter in the history of immigration policies in Canada

Since the Immigration Act of 1976, Canada has admitted immigrants to the country under three separate categories: family sponsorship, refugee and economic or independent categories. The Comprehensive Ranking System (CRS) is used to determine the eligibility of applicants from the economic category. The CRS is a ranking system based on human capital (education, work experience and knowledge of English/French) was used to attract young and educated applicants from around the world in order to fill the gaps in Canada's labor

market (Anwar, 2014, p. 175). While the CRS served the purpose of selecting applicants with the highest human capital, new immigrants continued to experience poor economic outcome compared to their Canadian counterparts (Anwar, 2014, p. 170). Their poor economic outcomes are largely due to the "difficulty that immigrants have transferring their foreign human capital to the Canadian labor market" and immigrants find "no return, and sometimes even a negative return" for their education and work experiences acquired outside of Canada (Sweetman & Warman, 2014, p.392).

Sweetman and Warman (2014) observed that many countries traditionally reliant on immigration noticed a decline in the "economic outcome" of newcomers and this led to calls for the "reform of immigration selection policies" in many countries including Canada (2014, p.391). In Canada, the reform led to the introduction of the Canadian Experience Class (CEC), a program that the authors claim was "part of a restructuring and diversification of the Economic Class, with a shift away from the points-based Skilled Worker Program" (Sweetman & Warman, 2014, p.391). The CEC recognizes "adaptability" as a crucial factor for better social and economic outcome for new immigrants (Sweetman & Warman, 2014, 391). This federal immigration category allows both Temporary Foreign Workers (TFWs) and former international students to switch their temporary status to permanent "in an expedited manner" without leaving Canada (Sweetman & Warman, 2014, p.391).

The efficiency of the CRS remained to be an issue as economic outcome of immigrants did not significantly change (Sweetman & Warman, 2014). In order to ensure that the skilled worker application and selection system is "responsive to labor market needs—including at the regional level", the federal government introduced the Express Entry system in 2015 (OECD, 2016, p.9). Express Entry is an application management system that provides

"flexibility" and efficiency in processing applications (OECD, 2016, p.9). Under Express Entry, the applications for permanent residency are still assessed using a CRS; however, the application process changed (OECD, 2016). Express Entry offered half of maximum points to applicants with a job offer or those nominated by the provinces and territories. However, the evaluation of Express Entry and stakeholders' feedback in 2015 – 2016 revealed two major issues. First, the allocation of maximum "600 points for job offers was distorting the balance with human capital" (IRCC, 2017, p.8). This meant that applicants with "poor scores for human capital" were invited because of job offer (IRCC, 2017, p.8). Second, the CRS did not award applicants with Canadian education and work experience (IRCC, 2017, p.8). Therefore, IRCC reduced the points for job offers and introduced additional points for applicants with Canadian education (IRCC, 2017, p.8). These reforms favored temporary foreign workers and international students already in Canada who were able to arrange employment and apply through CEC. As a result, CEC program applicants formed "more than a third of all admission under the Express Entry" in 2015 forming 44% of the 33,782 invitations (OECD, 2016, p.9-10 & IRCC, 2016, p.7).

As economies around the world became increasingly interconnected, globalized and competitive, Canada as an industrial economy remained heavily reliant on immigration for meetings its labor needs (OECD, 2016, p. 4). The global competition for labor forced Canada to attract not only skilled and flexible, but also temporary and cheap labor. This economic reality gave rise to temporary work permit programs. The temporary work permit programs are organized under two broad streams: Temporary Foreign Worker Program (TFWP) and the International Mobility Program (IMP), designed to meet "short-term labor" needs in the Canadian economy (Prokopenko & Hou, 2018, p.260).

The International Mobility Program (IMP) promotes Canada's "economic and cultural" interests and the program does not require Labor Market Impact Assessment (LMIA) while the TFWP does (Prokopenko & Hou, 2018, p.261). The IMP comprises several streams: International Agreements (e.g. NAFTA), Reciprocal Employment, Significant Benefit and the Research and Studies program that includes "former international students who hold post-graduate work visas" (Prokopenko & Hou, 2018, p.261). By offering employment programs and permanent residency through a number of pathways to international students, Gates-Gasse (2012) argues that Canada attempts to secure access to a locally educated labor force who "self-funded in terms of education, skills development, and integration" (p.273). The rise in the numbers of international students in developed countries around the world is in large part due to the internationalization of higher education and globalization.

Internationalization of Higher Education and Recruitment of International Students

The internationalization of higher education is seen as a "response" to globalization (Szyszlo, 2016, p.2). The process of internationalization involves institutions to ensure "greater convergence to international standards", therefore, it has influenced academic standards as well as instructional and recruitment practices around the world (Szyszlo, 2016, p.3). Although the internationalization of higher education is not a new concept, the "scale and scope of its impact" became more prominent in the late twentieth century (Szyszlo, 2016, p.2). Arthur and Flynn (2011) observed that the process of internationalization has been expedited by the increasing presence of international students who provide post-secondary institutions with "resources for the internationalization of curriculum, contacts for future recruitment" and "networks for longer-term international

relations" (p. 222). Altbach agrees with Szyszlo (2016) that internationalization of higher education is indeed a response to globalization, and further adds that internationalization has allowed post-secondary institutions to "to reap its benefits" (2007, p.291).

While globalization may be "unalterable" and inevitable, "internationalization involves many choices" (Altbach & Knight, 2007, p. 291). The internationalization of higher education "favors well-developed education systems and institutions, thereby compounding existing inequalities" (Altbach & Knight, 2007, p. 291). These initiatives are targeted at countries in the south and benefit countries in the north. The emphasis on "international academic mobility" is part of a global free trade narrative that considers "international higher education as a commodity to be freely traded and sees higher education as a private good, not a public responsibility" (Altbach & Knight, 2007, p. 291). According to the International Trade Canada, the "growth of outbound student mobility" from non-OECD countries with low per capita income increased by "161% between 2000 and 2012, compared to only 29% from high income OECD countries" (2016). The United States receives the largest number of international students. In 2014 – 2015, United States hosted "974, 926 of the world's 4.5 million" international students in the world (WES, 2016). European countries also have a long history of recruiting international students; "41% of the graduate programs in the top European universities are composed of international students" (Onk & Joseph, 2017, p.28).

Canada became a "top international student recruiter" in the past two decades although compared to the United States and the United Kingdom, the country is not a "major driving force in student recruitment" (Onk & Joseph, 2017, p.28). Canada's recruitment is predominately "self-funded" by universities and colleges while governments in the US and

UK invest in international student recruitment. In the UK for instance, recruitment is mainly carried out by the British Council, a branch of the British Government (Onk & Joseph, 2017, p.28). Canada's success in recruitment is due to the quality of education offered by post-secondary institutions and Canada's "diverse population" that draws many international students because of the strong presence of people from their "ethnic background" (Onk & Joseph, 2017, p.28). According to Canada's Bureau of International Education (CBIE), the growth of international students in Canada between 2008 and 2015 was around "92%" representing "187 nations" with half of the students coming from East Asian countries (2016, p.6).

Policies related to international education require the involvement of federal and provincial or territorial levels of government in Canada. According to the Canadian Constitution Act of 1867, Education in Canada is a provincial or territorial jurisdiction (CBIE, 2016, p.8). However, the federal government has jurisdiction over immigration as well as "international relations, trade, development cooperation, scientific research, labor force development and a host of other areas that intersect with international education" (CBIE, 2016, p.10). The decentralization of education in Canada is seen in provinces and territories making decisions about curriculum and other broader aspects of education while institutions that deliver education services lead the way in internationalizing the curriculum and their recruitment polices (CBIE, 2016, p.11). According to a survey of educational institutions, colleges and universities, almost all universities in Canada consider the "internationalization or global engagement" to be among the top priorities for their institutions (CBIE, 2016, p.11). Many provinces in Canada have developed policies for the internationalization of education. These policies are designed to prepare "students to

participate in a global economy and expanding the number of international students" (CBIE, 2016, p.8). These efforts aligned with efforts of the federal government to promote international education. For example, one of the objectives of Ontario's post-secondary education strategy is to ensure that the "pathways to residency support the retention of talent in Ontario" (CBIE, 2016, p.9).

Canada's federal, provincial and territorial governments began to promote Canada's higher education through *EduCanada: A World of Possibilities* a "branding initiative" that began in 2006 and was later rebranded *Imagine Education in Canada* (Becker & Kolster, 2012, p.37). These initiatives aimed to increase international student intake, promote Canadian education curricula in other parts of the world and promote the exchange of scholars and researchers between Canada and other countries (Becker & Kolster, 2012, p.38 & CBIE, 2016, p.10). In 2014, the federal government decided to make international education "a priority sector under the *Global Markets Action Plan*" and introduced the Canadian International Education Strategy (IES) (Govt. Canada, 2014 & Cox, 2014, p.6). The IES is a "national commitment to international education" in Canada, and this strategy is focused primarily on the recruitment of international students (CBIE, 2016, p.10). One of the priorities of this important policy document was to increase the number of international students from "239,131 in 2011 to more than 450,000 by 2022" (Govt. Canada, 2014 & Cox, 2014, p.6).

The number of international students worldwide was around two million in 2000 and it increased by three million in 2014 and it is estimated that it will increase to eight million by 2025 (CBIE, 2016, p.13). Canada is the "sixth most popular destination" for international students after the United States, United Kingdom, Australia, Germany and France (CBIE,

2016, p.13). The number of students in Canada increased around "92% between 2008 and 2015 (CBIE, 2016, p.13). Since the total number of international students present in Canada in 2017 reached 494,525, the target set for 2022 under the International Education Strategy of 2014 was met almost five years ahead of schedule (CBIE, 2018). What makes Canada particularly attractive for international students is the affordability of education and Canada's "strong educational reputation" (CBIE, 2016, p.15). Other factors such the opportunity for immigration and Canada's multicultural society attract foreign students to Canada (CBIE, 2016). In Belkhodja's assessment, "education quality" remains an important factor although the "possibility of acquiring permanent residency" continues to be a motivation for international students (2013, p. 2).

International Student and Post-secondary Institutions

The role of post-secondary institutions has evolved as providers of education with "direct impact on the economic, social and political development" of their provinces and territories (Suter & Jandl, 2008, p. 403). Canadian universities are seen as "major provider of highly skilled labor" (Suter & Jandl, 2008, p. 403). For students who wish to permanently immigrate for economic reasons, studying abroad is seen as a "stepping-stone to immigration" (Suter & Jandl, 2008, p. 403). The recruitment of international students is a source of revenue for both Canada and post-secondary institutions (Gopal, 2016, p. 131). International students are an attractive population because of their high enrollment in "science, technology, engineering, and math programs" (Gopal, 2016, p. 131). They are seen as potentially strong skilled workers in areas of the economy experiencing shortage of skilled labor.

Up until the year 2000, international students were visitors who were allowed into Canada for a specific period of time solely for the purpose of studying. They were seen as a source of income for the education institutions, a means of promoting internationalization and cultural ambassadors in the future for Canada in their respective countries (Belkhodja, 2013). However, currently many immigrant-receiving countries around the world including Canada are pursuing strategies at all levels of government to retain these students as economic immigrants because of their valuable "human capital" (Belkhodja, 2013, p. 3). Countries around the world are interested in international students because they "add to knowledge creation" within institutions and they serve the labor and demographic needs (Suter & Jandl, 2008, p. 406 - 408).

In Canada, nearly 43% of international students were attending "primary and secondary schools" in 1990s compared to 18% attending universities (Lu & Hou, 2015, p.2). In 2010, the percentage of students pursuing university level education jumped to 29% compared to 22% studying in primary and secondary schools (Lu & Hou, 2015, p.2). Another significant change between 1990s and 2010 was the "composition" of international students that saw source countries such as China and India rise to 37% of international students in 2010 from only 6% in 1990s while the number of students from Europe and USA fell from 32% to only 18% (Lu & Hou, 2015, p.2). One of the significant findings of Lu and Hou's study was that the cohort of 1990s showed that the rate of transition to permanent residency among students from India, China and Africa was "three times higher than the rates obtained by those who came from Northern/Western Europe and the United States" (2015, p.4). Lu and Hou (2015) attribute the increase in the rate of transition of students from India, China

and Africa to "economic development, job opportunities, and social and political environment" in those countries (2015, p.4).

Belkhodja (2013) argues that economic reasons, the success of the recruitment policies and the immigration opportunities offered by recruiting countries are among the reasons why so many students are studying abroad (p. 6). Students who intend to permanently immigrate to Canada benefit from education in Canada in many ways (Hou & Lu, 2017, p.8). First, the "quality of education" in Canada is higher than the developing countries many international students come from. (Hou & Lu, 2017, p.8). Second, students develop stronger language skills in Canada and become familiar with its culture and way of life. Finally, their employment trajectory is better than those educated outside of Canada given the familiarity of employers with Canadian education and their preference for graduates with Canadian education and work experience (Hou & Lu, 2017, p.8).

The large presence of international students in Canada has both immediate and long-term economic benefits. The immediate return for Canada is an increase in expenditures generated by international students. Under the 2014 International Education Strategy (IES), the total contribution by international students is estimated to increase from "approximately 7.7 billion annually" in 2012 to "over 16 billion by 2022" (Cox, 2014, p.4). In 2016, the total economic contribution by international students was "15.5 billion" and their contribution to the GDP was "12.8 billion" (Esses, Sutter, Ortiz, Luo, Cui & Deacon, 2018, p. 1). In the long-term, this strategy also allows the government of Canada to "strengthen the economy through locally educated, skilled labor" and offer pathways for permanent residency to address long-term labor market needs and population decline (Cox, 2014, p.4). International students possess valuable human capital; therefore, they are an attractive group for

permanent residency. First, they are "highly skilled workers" and "support economic development" in Canada (Arthur & Flynn, 2011, p. 223). Second, they possess "local experience" that make them more attractive than foreign graduates who studied and worked outside of Canada and finally, international students are young and at the beginning of their career, which make them ideal immigrants to replace an aging and declining workforce population. (Arthur & Flynn, 2011, p. 223).

Belkhodja and Wade (2011) argue that the prospect of international students becoming permanent residents offers recruiting countries an option to address "low birthrate and the ageing population" (p.182). The recruitment and retention of international students have expanded in the last decade. According to IRCC, the number of international students who intended to permanently immigrate to Canada averaged "between 15% and 20%" in 2008 (Suter & Jandl, 2008, p.411). By 2016, this number rose to 51%, a dramatic increase since 2008 (CBIE, 2016). A survey of international students by Esses, et al (2018) revealed that 65% intended to apply for PGWP and 68% of international students "had plans to apply for permanent residency" (p. 3). One of the ways countries attempt to attract international students is by "formalizing the link between higher education degree attainment and skilled migration" (Gopal, 2016, p. 132). Gopal claims that while countries such as the United States and United Kingdom focused on "securing their borders and curbing immigration in the last two decades, making it more challenging for international students to pursue their studies", other countries such as Canada and Australia reacted by "relaxing their immigration policies for international students" because of the enormous economic gains (Gopal, 2016, p. 132).

Employment Programs and Permanent Residency Pathways

OECD member countries, including Canada "attract 90% of the worlds' high skilled migrants" largely due to their "developed economies and decreasing birth rate" (Belkhodja & Wade, 2011, p. 181). According to Howthorne (2008), the biggest single factor impacting economies in the OECD countries will be the "demographic trends" such as low fertility rate and "aging" (p.1). For instance, according to projections by the United Nations, the population of working age Canadian will decline significantly in the next 25 years, which will be the "second largest decline among Group of Seven (G7) countries and the fourth largest among all OECD countries" (Advantage Canada Report, 2006, p. 20). This will add to the shortage of skilled labor already experienced in the Canadian labor market and negatively affect economic growth and lower "living standards" (Advantage Canada Report, 2006, p. 20). The implications for the Canadian economy according to this report are slower growth of the labor force and shortage of skilled labor.

The Advantage Canada Report by the Ministry of Finance offered a few recommendations to Canadian policy makers. First, the report called for the alignment of immigration policies with the needs of the labor market (Advantage Canada Report, 2006, p. 49). The second recommendation called for the strengthening of the Provincial Nominee Programs as they are strategically placed to assess the labor needs of the local market. The report emphasized that the two potentially strong candidates for skilled labor are "skilled temporary foreign workers with Canadian work experience and foreign graduates from Canadian colleges and universities, as these groups are well placed to adapt quickly to the Canadian economy" (Advantage Canada Report, 2006, p. 49). The report concluded with a policy commitment by the Canadian Government to "[E]examining ways to make it easier for

Canadian-educated foreign students and temporary foreign workers to stay in Canada and become Canadian citizens" (Advantage Canada Report, 2006, p. 50). Thus, the recruitment policies pursued by post-secondary institutions aligned with the Canadian government's recognition that both international students and temporary foreign workers can adapt to the Canadian economy because of their locally acquired Canadian education and work experience. Therefore, the Canadian government introduced employment programs such as the *Post-Graduate Work Permit (PGWP)* and *Off-Campus Work Permit (OCWP)* (Cox, 2014, p.9). Pathways for permanent immigration with different qualifying criteria were initially established under the Provincial Nominee Programs and the Canadian Experience Class (CEC), which is a federal immigration category was introduced (Cox, 2014, p.11).

She & Wotherspoon (2013) observe that immigration policies have evolved into a "demand-driven immigration" that ensures the needs of the labor market determine the intake of immigration and a shift away from "supply-driven mode of immigration" (p. 2). Countries realize that they can avoid costs and be more targeted in their immigration policies. When it comes to selection policies, countries emphasize language proficiency, work experience obtained in the recruiting country or as close to it as possible and for those reasons, international students and temporary foreign workers are ideal candidates for permanent residency (She & Wotherspoon, 2013, p. 2). Immigrant receiving countries such as Canada have refined their selection criteria to attract and admit immigrants with not only official language skills, but also local experience and education.

The Immigration and Refugee Protection Act's (IRPA) regulations determine who is eligible to study in Canada with or without a study permit and what "work privileges" those students can enjoy during and after their studies (CIC, 2015, p.2). The IRPA allows

international students to register for courses and programs that are six months in length. In order to further "streamline" the process, the Canadian government allowed international students to obtain one study permit for the entire duration of their study with flexibility to switch between programs of study and post-secondary institutions without applying for another study permit (CIC, 2010, p.3). Currently international students can generally engage in four types of employment: On Campus, Off Campus, Co-op and Internship Programs and Post-Graduation (CIC, 2010, p.5).

Off-Campus Work Permit (OCWP)

Introduced in 2006, the OCWP allows students to work for up to 20 hours a week while they are studying (CIC, 2010). Students do not require a work permit in order to work on campus if they already have a valid study permit. However, prior to June 1, 2014, international students required a work permit in order to work off campus (CIC, 2015, p.2). They also had to meet other requirements namely being registered in a full-time program of study for six months and "be in a satisfactory academic standing" in order to receive an OCWP (CIC, 2015, p.2). Students in language programs and general interest courses did not qualify for OCWP (CIC, 2015, p.2). The changes introduced in 2014, allow "some applicants holding study permit" to work off campus without first obtaining work permit (CIC, 2015, p.2). The changes allow students to work 20 hours during their academic year and on full-time basis "during the regularly schedule academic breaks"; however, these changes do not apply to students studying in language programs (CIC, 2015, p.2). After graduation, students can apply for an open work permit that allows them to work for maximum of three years to acquire the experience needed to qualify for permanent residency or simply gain work experience in Canada (Gopal, 2016, p. 133).

Co-op Work permit

Prior to changes introduced on June 1, 2014, international students were required to apply for a work permit in order to participate in co-op or internship programs (CIC, 2015, p.3). In order to qualify for work permit, the co-op or internship had to be "an essential and integral part of their course of study, but not more than 50% of the total program of study" (CIC, 2015, p.3). The changes introduced in 2014, still require the co-op or internship to be an "integral part" of the program of study (CIC, 2015, p.3). However, students no longer require a work permit to complete their co-op, internship or other work-related aspects of their study (CIC, 2014, p.3). This requirement evidently disadvantages international students who might not be able to participate in a co-op program because it does not constitute an "integral part" of the program.

Post-Graduate Work Permit (PGWP)

The PGWP, introduced in 2005 initially allowed only students from "recognized educational institutions outside Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver" to apply for work permit after graduation for one year with the possibility of extending it for another year (CIC, 2010, p.3). In 2008, the government increased the duration of the work permit for up to three years and removed other restrictions by allowing students to accept employment in any occupation without first receiving a job offer (CIC, 2010, p. 3). However, only skilled occupation would count towards permanent residency applicants under federal immigration categories. The PGWP is "limited to the duration of the student's study program (minimum of eight months, and up to a maximum of three years)" (CIC, 2015, p.3). In order to qualify for PGWP, the applicant "must have ceased to be a student" or have met the requirement of their program of study and have graduated (CIC, 2014, p.3). International

students receive half of the credit for the time they spent in Canada on a visa or work permit towards their residency requirement. This provision was removed under the Bill C 24 in 2014, but it was restored in 2016 (CBIE, 2016, p.12).

Canadian Experience Class (CEC)

The Canadian Experience Class (CEC) is a federal immigration program designed for former international students and temporary foreign workers. The CEC was designed after studies ordered by Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (formerly known as Citizenship and Immigration Canada) in 2006 suggested that those with Canadian experience "do better as permanent residents than those without it" (Auditor General of Canada, 2009). The CEC "allows skilled temporary foreign workers with Canadian work experience and international students with Canadian degrees and Canadian work experience to apply for permanent residency based on specific criteria related to their work experience and their knowledge of Canada's official languages" (Auditor General of Canada, 2009).

In order to qualify for CEC, the applicant has to acquire "one year of full-time experience" or "at least 1, 560 hours in a year" completed in the three years before the application (CIC, 2014). The work experience "must be in a skilled occupation" specified in three categories: Skill Level 0, Skill Level A and Skill Level B (CIC, 2014). The three categories of skilled occupation require education acquired from the college level (Skill Level B) or a bachelor, masters or doctoral level (Skill Level A) and managerial level occupation (Skill Level 0) (CIC, 2014). Part-time work and work experience students acquired during an "internship or co-op placement" do not count towards the work experience requirement for a CEC application (CIC, 2014). The CEC immigration category also requires language

proficiency in English or French and that varies based on the skill level of employment. Students must take a language test approved by IRCC (CIC, 2014).

The other requirements include the candidate not being a "threat to the health, safety or security of Canada" and students must undergo "medical examination, [and submit] police certificate and a language assessment" in addition to paying $550 application fees (CIC, 2014). In addition to the CEC, the work experience accumulated through participation in the PGWP program and their Canadian education grant international students additional points to apply for other federal immigration categories through the Express Entry system. Under the Express Entry, applicants with Canadian education receive between 15 – 30 points depending on their level of education (IRCC, 2017, p.14). While international students' education and work experience in Canada qualify them for Federal Skilled Worker Program or Federal Skilled Trades Program, CEC remains the most appropriate federal immigration category for them in the Express Entry system. This is evident in the number of international students who applied to become permanent residents through the Canadian Experience Class (CEC) in that last three years. The total number of international students with a prior Post-Graduate Work Permit who applied to CEC in 2015 was 10, 220 and there was a slight increase in 2016; however, the number increased to 18, 730 in 2017; recording an increase of 41% over the previous two years (IRCC, 2018).

The OECD report (2016) evaluated the introduction of the Express Entry system as a positive step by adding to the "competitive edge of the selection system", which ensures that newcomers to Canada have the highest chance of succeeding in the labor market (p.7). This report was critical of the Express Entry system for awarding "half of the maximum available points" for candidates who have a job offer (OECD, 2016, p.2). With introduction of CEC, one

of the ways Canada is looking to ensure new migrants succeed is that it gives preference to those who are "partly pre-integrated" and those are temporary workers and international students (OECD, 2016, p.8). This report highlights that due to this focus, the "share of onshore transition [to permanent residency] has more than tripled over the past decade"; however, it is still significantly smaller than Australia, New Zealand and the United States (OECD, 2016, p.8).

Provincial Nominee Programs

The regional labor and demographic needs in Canada became more pronounced in the last two decades and these realities gave rise to provincial nominee programs (PNPs). The PNPs allow provinces and territories to select immigrants that best suit their regional needs. Additionally, the provinces and territories provide settlement services to ensure effective integration and long-term retention of newcomers in those regions. Provincial and territorial administration of immigration policies is based on the Section 95 of the Constitution Act of 1867 (Bagaly, 2012, p. 122). The increasing role and influence of provinces and territories in the selection of immigrants and the expansion and diversification of the PNPs marked a historic change in the administration of immigration in Canada. Bagaly (2012) argues that a centralized administration of immigration could not effectively respond to "diverse economic, demographic, and social needs of provinces and territories" (p. 122).

The PNPs first instituted in the 1990s allow provinces and territories to "establish their own" streams and criteria for the selection of applicants. Some of the common streams that all provinces have established are skilled worker, business, family sponsorship and the international students' stream (Bagaly, 2012, p. 127). Studying in the province and intention

to reside there are among standard requirements for PNPs. Other requirements for nomination under PNPs vary amongst the provinces and territories; however, they are less demanding than the CEC. The division of responsibilities and areas of jurisdiction between the provinces/territories and the federal government allow provinces and territories to select applicants who best fit their socioeconomic needs. On the other hand, issues of criminality, security and health remain exclusively the authority of the federal government (Bagaly, 2012).

The internationalization of higher education in Canada and the increasing recruitment of international students aligned with Government of Canada's economic agenda to respond to economic and demographic needs of the country. Canada's immigration policies have for the most part focused on promoting the country's economic prosperity. Therefore, the retention of international students as skilled labor immigrants contributes to the overall economic prosperity of Canada. The employment programs and permanent residency pathways designed to retain international students in Canada have helped promote Canada as a desirable destination to pursue undergraduate and graduate level education. However, international students have experienced difficulties finding skilled employment that is relevant to their field of study and commensurate with their education. Furthermore, lack of settlement support has made the immigration process challenging and frustrating for these students.

CHAPTER II

Transition Barriers to Employment and Permanent Residency

This chapter presents the findings of research related to barriers international students experience transitioning to employment and permanent residency. In terms of their transition to employment, it is evident in the research literature that international students experience difficulty entering the Canadian labor market due to lack of employment preparation and the Canadian employers' preference for Canadian experience. In terms of seeking permanent residency, the barriers identified in the literature are complexities of policies and procedures and lack of awareness about pathways to permanent residency. Finally, lack of settlement services further complicates the transition to employment and permanent residency for international students who intend to work and permanently immigrate to Canada.

The development of policies to retain international students as immigrants is very recent in Canada. Therefore, there is limited research related to the final stage of their journey when they make important choices whether to return to their home country or pursue employment and permanent residency in Canada. The research has been mainly focused on the initial phase of their journey and examines issues related to their adjustment in the recruiting country in terms "intrapersonal, interpersonal, language and academic issues" (Arthur & Flynn, 2011, p. 224). International students also experience difficulty succeeding in the labor market despite their qualification and work experience in Canada. These students "had lower salaries, relied less frequently on their formal qualification" and expressed "lower job satisfaction than other migrants" (Howthorne, 2008 & Bouajram, 2015, p. 7). Therefore, research needs to examine how international students adjust to permanent

residency status. International students have "unique service needs"; there are "gaps in specialized service provisions" and they are not eligible for settlement services funded by the federal government (Roach, 2011, p. 17).

1. **Lack of Employment Preparation and Obstacles to Labor Market Integration**

Literature on this topic identifies that international students face barriers when entering the Canadian labor market. These barriers stem from employers' preference for Canadian work experience. International students are also unprepared in terms of knowledge and experience of the Canadian labor market and continue to experience the challenge of language and cultural adaptability to Canadian workplaces. Finally, lack of social and professional networks further complicates the process of entering the labor market for students.

1.1. Real and Perceived Barriers to Enter Labor Market

A survey of international students conducted by the Canadian Bureau of International Education (CBIE) in 2007 found that the "population perceives there are significant barriers to labor market entry" and issues such as "discrimination in hiring" and "inconsistent policies" were listed as examples (Cox, 2014, p. 44). A study by Scott, Safdar, Trilokekar, & Masri (2015), that included 48 international students at two post-secondary institutions in Ontario, confirmed that "prejudicial attitudes and discriminatory behavior" by Canadian employers was the "primary obstacle" to finding employment in their career (p.8). Roach (2011) found that Canadian employers "discriminate against international students' lack of Canadian work experience" (2011, p.39). Additionally, she discovered that Canadian work experience was evaluated based on students' knowledge of the Canadian "workplace culture" (2011, p. 39). Consequently, in order for international students to find employment,

they needed information and training about the expectations of Canadian employers (Roach, 2011, p.39).

Lack of Canadian experience seem to affect both male and female international students, equally. Fais (2012), who wrote about the experiences of female international students, concluded that, like male international students, her female interviewees considered "lack of Canadian work experience as an obstacle to finding employment" (p.97). Gomez (2017) found that temporary status also disadvantaged international students in "access[ing] opportunities otherwise made available to permanent residents or citizens" (p.52). In their study of 16 international students, Nunes and Arthur (2013) revealed that students considered "their lack of work experience, citizenship status" and lack of personal and professional contacts as barriers to finding employment (p.41). Although it is difficult to determine what type of occupations and what type of employers require permanent status, it is important to acknowledge that lack of permanent status adds additional obstacles for international students seeking employment. Scott, et al (2015) claim that there is a "preconceived notion that IS [international students] would create an administrative burden due to paper work and dealing with government" (p.8). This perception among employers leads to discrimination against international students and adversely affects their chances of securing employment and permanent residency.

1.2.Limited Work Placement Opportunities and Lack of Employment Preparation

Research indicates that there are limited opportunities for work placement for international students, and their temporary status and lack of experience make it difficult to access these opportunities. As a result, international students are left unprepared to enter the labor market and, therefore, their long-term career aspirations are negatively affected.

Qian (2017), who interviewed Chinese international students and the staff of an international student office, reached a similar conclusion. These interviews revealed that international students' failure to find employment was associated with difficulties they experienced securing "co-op and internship" placement (p. 44). In some cases, international students stated that there was lack of work placement opportunities in their specific programs (Qian, 2017, p.44).

Scott, et al (2015) reported that, "unlike domestic students, [international students] are not offered practicum or internship opportunities, and where such opportunities did exist, students regretted that they could not get hired" (p.8). Roach (2011) claimed that international students do not qualify for "job mentoring, work placements or internship programs offered by the federal government, or for the various summer employment programs offered by Employment Ontario" (p. 42). International students assessed work placement as an opportunity to "connect with industry professionals" and the lack of such opportunities they believed left them unprepared to enter the labor market in Canada (Scott, et al, 2015, p.8). Their lack of Canadian work experience and the fact that they are competing with Canadian students for work placement opportunities were the reasons for their lack of success. Roach (2011) confirmed the findings of other studies that work placement opportunities are crucial to finding employment and she argued that if provided to international students, those opportunities "even the playing field when international students are trying to enter the Canadian labor market for the first time" (p. 39).

Cox (2014) pointed out a lack of "initiatives" by institutions in providing "post-graduation employment readiness programs" for international students (p.43). Roach (2011) highlighted the lack of Canadian "workplace culture training" considered a "key

barrier facing international students entering the Canadian labor market" (p.39). Qian's study acknowledged that in addition to the lack of employment readiness programs, international students' experiences from outside of Canada were "under-valued" by employers in Canada. (2017, p. 44). International students interviewed by Nunes and Arthur (2013) regretted the lack of "access to diversified, well-advertised career fairs" when they are searching for employment (p.38). One of the reasons according to Cox (2014) for not developing "post-graduation employment readiness program" to better prepare these students to enter labor market in Canada is in part due to "ethical dilemma of retaining international students after graduation", something the Canadian colleges and universities intend to avoid (p. 43- 44). The concept of "brain drain refers to the phenomenon of unethical recruitment of highly skilled professionals" who are retained in the recruiting country after their education (Covell, et al, 2015, p. 28). Docquier and Rapport (2016) observe that "brain drain (or high skill) migration is becoming a dominant pattern of international migration and a major aspect of globalization" (p.681). It benefits the recruiting countries and drains the sending countries of the human capital invested in their citizens (Docquier & Rapport, 2016). However, Becker and Kolster (2012) argue that unless the opportunities for employment improve in the sending countries, international students will continue to stay in host countries like Canada.

According to Lu, Li and Schissel (2009) who surveyed 160 international students at the University of Saskatchewan, international students in undergraduate programs are more disadvantaged than graduate students. First, their Canadian degree does not help them as much because of their lack of Canadian work experience. Second, undergraduate students have little work experience because of their age and there are few opportunities for them to

acquire work experience on campus compared to graduate students (p. 286). Since undergraduate programs enroll significantly more students compared to graduate programs, they do not allow sufficient interaction with teachers for mentoring and advice. Graduate students usually receive employment within academic departments to acquire experience and to lessen their financial burden while undergraduate students do not receive such opportunities.

1.3.Minimal Professional Networks

Arthur and Flynn (2011) who interviewed 19 undergraduate and graduate international students for their study revealed that another factor that facilitates or hinders the transition process to employment and permanent residency is social and professional networks (p.229). Qian's study confirmed findings that limited social and professional connections and a lack of strong English skills required in the workplace were "barriers for them [international students] to find jobs in Canada" (2017, p. 44). Scott, et al (2015) argue that lack of the "same opportunities for networking and off-campus employment as domestic students" place international student in a disadvantaged position to find employment after graduation (p.7).

International students in the study by Nunes and Arthur (2013) revealed that educational institutions could and should do more to "help students build networks and meet prospective employers" (p.39). Graduate students especially felt neglected by career services available on campus because their programs are geared mostly towards undergraduate students (Nunes & Arthur, 2013, p.39). In the study by Arthur and Popadiuk (2013) international students discussed the positive "influence" of the role university professors and advisors played in their transition from "school-to-work" (p.278). While such

informal mentoring opportunities are fairly common across educational institutions, "[F]formal mentoring programs" for these students are not consistently available and "seem to be non-existence" in some institutions (Arthur & Popadiuk, 2013, p. 278). Off campus employment is particularly essential for international students because they need the experience of the "Canadian workplace" and the opportunity of networking with employers (Nunes & Arthur, 2013, p.40).

2. Limitations of Services Offered by International Students Offices

Roach (2011) conducted interviews at international student offices at four post-secondary institutions in Toronto. She found out that international student offices within post-secondary institutions are international students' "primary source of social support", however, these offices lack the capacity, resources and mandate to offer the type of "specialized services" that students need (p. 18). The most important argument in this debate according to Roach (2011) is the characterization of an international student as someone who would return at the end of their studies and not a "temporary sojourn" in Canada and this categorization determines the perception of their eligibility for services (p. 27). Covell, Neiterman, Atanackovic, Owusu & Bourgeault (2015) suggests that most international students are not seen as immigrants by the Canadian government (p.34). This maintain a "symbolic" distinction between those who intend to stay and those planning to return to their countries of origin (Clovell, et al, 2015, p.34). In addition to international students offices' lack capacity and resources, under Bill C-91 those providing employment and immigration advice to international students are required to be licensed by the Immigration Consultants of Canada Regulatory Council (Covell, et al, 2015, p. 30). The study by Roach (2011) reported that the number of advisors qualified and licensed to provide

immigration advice was limited (p.29). This further complicates the provision of services by international student offices.

Consequently, there are inconsistencies in service delivery by international student offices in post-secondary institutions in Canada. Roach (2011) who studied service needs and gaps related to international students' services found "differential service provisions" exist across post-secondary institutions (p. 29). For instance, the study revealed that only one international student office among the four that participated in this study could refer international students to "service providers in the community for extended support or settlement services" (Roach, 2011, p. 29). Some international student offices were able to offer bridging services, but this was inconsistent across the institutions and these services were "non-mandated" and did not seem "sustainable" (Roach, 2011, p. 31). Covell, et al (2015) reveal in their study that "educational institutions' primary goal is to deliver education" and they do not consider helping international students with permanent residency as "part of their responsibilities" (p. 31).

Roach also identified that international student offices were "overburdened" given the increasing responsibilities and growing complexity and uniqueness of those services. (2011, p. 32). One international student office in Roach's study acknowledged that providing immigration advice and services to international students was beyond their capacity. The office' practice of merely referring international students to government websites was not sufficient to address international students' needs given the complexity of the process for employment and permanent residency (Roach, 2011, p. 30). Roach concluded that the issue of qualifications of international student staff, the nature and uniqueness of services they

provided and lack of sufficient funding were among key issues impacting service delivery by international student (2011, p. 33-34).

3. Complexities of Employment and Immigration Procedures and Lack of Awareness

Roach's study reported that conversations with international student advisors revealed students needed "immigration advice from someone with a thorough knowledge of the immigration pathways and legal aspects of the process" (Roach, 2011, p. 26). The notion that the process is "easy" is not accurate according to the findings of this study (Roach, 2011, p. 26). The interviews further revealed that students expressed the desire for more "information beyond what they find on government websites" and during the "information sessions at their institutions" (Roach, 2011, p. 27). For instance, students cannot readily distinguish between the categories of occupations that qualify for permanent residency (Roach, 2011, p. 28).

The staff of the international student office interviewed in Qian's study (2017) confirmed that one of international students' serious challenges is navigating the "complexity of immigration policies" and procedures (p.51). The same concerns were raised by international students in Gomez's (2017) study. They expressed frustration about how the process of transition to work and permanent residency seemed to be presented as easy and straight forward, but it was rather more complicated than it was presented to be (Gomez, 2017, p.51). Gomez particularly emphasized time constraints related to applying for Post-Graduate Work Permit (PGWP), the window of 90 days to apply for or leave Canada was too short for students to decide (2017, p.48). In Kelly's (2012) study, international students also expressed concern about time limitations in collecting the documents required as part of the

application for permanent residency and the difficulty of obtaining them from their country of citizenship because in some cases they had to apply for those documents in person (p. 33).

Kelly (2012) who interviewed a diverse group of international students who were either working or were in the process of applying for permanent residency, reported that international students' expectations about the application process and the timeline for permanent residency varied from one student to another (p.33). Kelly's findings are confirmed in Cobb's study who reported that the two sources of information about immigration process were the internet and friends who had gone through the process indicating that there is a lack of accurate information about the immigration policies (2012, p.36). A study by Covell, et al (2015), found that alongside language, "lack of knowledge about the immigration system" was seen as a significant barrier (p.27). In reviewing the results of a survey of international students in the Atlantic regions, Belkhodja (2013) note the lack of awareness on the part of the students about their options for immigration. The survey revealed that "students had little knowledge of the specific [federal immigration] programs that could facilitate their transition to permanent residency" (Belkhodja, 2013, p.3). This further underscores the need for active collaboration among the stakeholders to ensure that international students have access to timely and accurate information.

4. Social Inclusion and Cultural Adaptation

International students' connection and involvement with the host society is crucial in "promoting intercultural knowledge" between the two groups (Scott, et al, 2015). Community connectedness and identity; and perception of discrimination" are among the most important barriers to integration for international students (Scott, et al, 2015). These types of interactions facilitate opportunities for social networking and support. However,

limiting international students' interaction with the host community to university campuses does not facilitate "meaningful social interaction" (Scott, et al, 2015). Cox identified "English language proficiency, cultural adjustment, and academic acculturation" as the most important barriers for international students (2014, p.35). Interaction between international students and the host community could foster "intercultural knowledge", developing "social support networks" and increase a sense of belonging for international students (Scott, et al, 2015). Zhou and Zhang (2014) who studied social integration of international students in an Ontario university highlighted the social isolation of international students in Canadian colleges and universities. This study found that "73% of participants had never personally contacted their instructors" (Zhou & Zhang, 2014, p.12). The study recognizes that the level of connection between the faculty and students is a "significant indicator of social integration" in an academic environment (Zhou & Zhang, 2014, p.12). Their study also revealed that "only 37% shared residence with domestic students and 10% reported going out with them" (Zhou & Zhang, 2014, p.12).

Arthur & Flynn (2011) observed that international students go through three phases of transition starting with "managing the cross-cultural transition of entering a new culture" followed by "learning in a new cultural context," and finally "transferring international expertise to work settings in the host or home countries" (p. 224). Tseng and Newton (2002) identify four major categories of adjustment challenges experienced by international students: general living adjustment, academic adjustment, socio-cultural adjustment and personal psychological adjustment (p. 591 - 592). International students lose their "immediate support network" when they travel outside of their home country and their contact with nationals of the new country is minimal at the beginning (Bouajram, 2015, p.

12). Cox (2014) recommend connecting international students to "social resources within immigrants' ethno-cultural or linguistic community" in order to facilitate their socio-cultural transition and integration into the Canadian society (p.41).

Scott and colleagues (2015) argue that "socio-cultural adaptation" of international students remains an issue affecting their integration to the host society. Lu and et al (2009) found in their study of Chinese international students that "social and emotional supports" were crucial in their intention to stay in Canada permanently (p. 308). Gates-Gasse's review of research about international students in the United States and the United Kingdom confirm the findings that social support especially from other students "played a key role in their intention to immigrate permanently (2012, p. 278). Their study found that "support to foster their feelings of belonging" was necessary for female students while male students needed "increased support to build social networks" (Lu, et al, 2009, p. 308). This study concluded that "successful experiences in social and cultural adaptation will increase the likelihood that they will choose to stay" (Lu, et al, 2009, p. 308).

Bouajram (2015) argues that it is necessary to understand the adaptation of international students and their transition from "student to worker or worker to permanent resident" through an intercultural lens (p. 12). International students perceive themselves as "not being culturally appropriate during job interviews" and are concerned about cultural barriers that affect their integration into Canadian society in general and the workplace in particular. (Arthur & Flynn, 2011, p. 229). Employment is also a means of connecting students to the community, which can foster a "sense of belonging" (Cox, 2014, p. 41). Being employed in Canada helps students acquire both language and cultural knowledge (Cox, 2014, p. 41). While the majority of participants had experienced some feelings of social

isolation and a period of cultural adaptation at the beginning of their studies, this was a persistent challenge for only a few participants. Many of the participants who spoke of lingering challenges beyond their initial years studying in Canada mentioned the lack of social support as a result of being away from family and friends for an extended period of time" (Kelly, p.28)

The assumption that international students are proficient in the official languages of Canada and because of the time they have spent in Canada as a student overlooks their needs for settlement support. The gap in settlement services has complicated their access to employment and permanent residency in Canada. It is evident in the research that international students experience difficulty entering the Canadian labor market due to lack of employment preparation and the Canadian employers' preference for Canadian experience. In terms of seeking permanent residency, the lack of settlement support and complexities of immigration procedures are among the most important barriers facing these students.

CHAPTER III

Review of Settlement Research and Best Practices

This chapter reviews research literature on settlement programs and services to examine how research is responding to transition experiences of international students. International students experience difficulties integrating into the Canadian labor market and raises many questions. For instance, why do students who are educated in Canadian universities and colleges experience difficulty entering the labor market after graduation? One school of thought holds that the "misbalance between the officially stated needs of the

labour market […] and the real labour market opportunities for newcomers" is why so many economic immigrants cannot find employment commensurate with their education (Sapeha, 2015, p.894). A similar observation was made about the Australian context where visas issued to "overcome local skill shortages"; however, those migrants who received the visas for the skill and qualifications relevant to the labor shortage, were not able to find "employment in the areas for which their visas have been granted" (Rynderman & Flynn, 2016, p.281). The other school of thought identifies lack of settlement support and institutional barriers for unsuccessful labor market integration of international students.

This chapter examines the need for settlement support for international students and how providing such support could facilitate effective settlement and integration of international students into Canadian society. This review of settlement research will also discuss implications of lack of such support for both international students and other economic immigrants. The absence of settlement support negatively affects their immediate settlement and long-term integration of international students in Canada. This chapter will also highlight solutions and strategies to address the challenges of transition found in the literature. This chapter will finally emphasize the role and responsibilities of each stakeholder in facilitating a smooth transition for international students. A review of best practices in Canada and around the world will be provided in the hope of promoting these practices across post-secondary institutions in Canada.

The Need for Settlement Services

Settlement services are designed to meet the most essential needs of newcomers for the purpose of facilitating their full and successful integration into the host society (Shields, et al, 2016). Settlement services go beyond meeting "immediate needs" and have long-term

impact on the life of newcomers in the receiving countries (Shields et al, 2016, p. 5). Settlement services assist newcomers "make the necessary adjustments for a life in their host society" and facilitate the "smooth transition necessary to be able to more fully participate in the economy and society" of the host country (Shields, et al, 2016, p. 4). Drolet and Kaushik (2018) consider settlement as the "preliminary steps in the integration process in which the initial needs of immigrants are met" (p.3). According to Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (IRCC), successful integration is achieved when immigrants are able to "contribute, free of barriers, to every dimension of Canadian life—economic, social, cultural, and political" (2011, p.4).

Settlement services are guided by the "model of integration" that the host country adopts, and Canada follows a "pluralist integration approach" (Shields, et al, 2016, p. 6). The integration model in Canada originates from the national narrative that Canada is a multicultural nation and the state has a responsibility to support multiculturalism adopted as an official policy in 1976. Therefore, integration has been seen through the lens of multiculturalism. As a multicultural nation, Canada recognizes that immigrants would like to celebrate their "ethnic identity" and the policy of multiculturalism encourages "public institutions to accommodate these ethnic identities" (Ugland, 2014, p.145). Sheilds, et al (2016) observe that the process of integration includes the following three phases:

- Adjustment: acclimatization and getting used to the new culture, language, people and environment or coping with the situation
- Adaptation: learning and managing the situation without a great deal of help
- Integration: actively participating, getting involved and contributing as citizen of a new country (p. 6).

International students are perceived to be pre-integrated because of the time they spent in Canada studying and working. There are high expectations that as prospective immigrants, they are easily employable given their Canadian qualifications. These assumptions and expectations undoubtedly understate their need for settlement services. According to the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA), "integration involves mutual obliterations for new immigrants and Canadian society"; however, the act limits settlement services to only permanent residents and convention refugees (Gates-Gasse, 2012, p. 274). Given Immigration, Refugee Protection Act's (IRPA) eligibility criteria, international students who transition to worker status after completing their studies are not eligible for federally funded settlement services. While provincially funded settlement services are less restricted in terms of eligibility, they are a "minority" compared to the federally funded support (Gates-Gasse, 2012, p. 274). Gates-Gasse (2012), recognizes that while the "integration [of international students] into Canadian society is an enormously important component of the settlement process", this process currently involves only international students given the absence of settlement support by the Canadian government (p. 274).

The immigration pathways made available to international students have evolved over the years at both federal and provincial levels of government. Gates-Gasse argues that in order for these prospective immigrants to successfully immigrate and integrate into the Canadian society, there needs to be settlement support in addition to streamlined and "accelerated work permit procedure and permanent residency pathways" (2012, p. 274). However, their eligibility support for federally funded programs has not changed. Calls for settlement support for international students are made at a time when for decades "Canada's

immigration system has followed this trend of neoliberalism and privatization" (Flynn & Bauder, 2014, p.3). Flynn and Bauder (2014) argue the Canadian government increasingly relies on employers, private sector actors such as universities and civil society, therefore, "relieving the federal government of much of its responsibility and accountability in helping to ensure the success of immigrants entering Canada" (p.3). For instance, international student offices are burdened with assisting international students who wish to seek employment and permanent residency in Canada. Additionally, employers are increasingly involved in providing settlement support to immigrants selected under the provincial nominee programs (Flynn & Bauder, 2014, p.3).

There are undoubtedly many unintended consequences of relying on private sector for settlement services. Sapeha (2015) cautions that one of the implications of downloading settlement services to "non-state actors" could lead to "increasing dependence of immigrants on their close and extended families and ethno-cultural communities" (p.908). Such dependence "might impede migrants' interaction with the receiving society" and consequently affect their successful integration (Sapeha, 2015, p.908). There is broad consensus in the research literature that while "relatives, friends or a similar ethno-cultural community" can facilitate better settlement and integration, newcomers "who made new friends in Canada that belong to different ethno-cultural groups tend to be more satisfied compared to those without new friends or those whose circle of friends come from the same ethno-cultural group" (Sapeha, 2015, p. 894-907).

Because of Canada's Comprehensive Ranking System (CRS) and the immigration system's focus on skilled workers and their human capital, it is often assumed that the "settlement and integration of skilled immigrants is moderately easy in Canada and that

skilled immigrants do well in Canada after a brief adjustment period" (Drolet & Kaushik, 2018, p.2). However, skilled immigrants' "settlement experiences are distinct from" other immigrants, therefore, the authors argue they require unique settlement support. (Drolet & Kaushik, 2018, p.3). For example, skilled immigrants emphasize their professional success in the host country. Therefore, settlement services should be focused on their successful labor market integration. In terms of employment, the most common barriers reported are "lack of recognition of foreign credentials, lack of recognition of work experiences or employers' requirement for Canadian experience, difficulty obtaining references, and discrimination" (Drolet & Kaushik, 2018, p.5). Similarly, the literature review of international students' experiences of transition to work and permanent residency in Canada revealed that lack of Canadian work experience and discrimination by Canadian employers were amongst significant barriers.

Canada could learn from the experiences of countries such as Australia that experimented the two-step immigration. The review of skilled migration in Australia reported by Howthorne and To (2014) during 2005-2006 revealed "significant problems related to labor market integration" of international students (p.102). For instance, international students' annual income was nearly twenty thousand dollars lower than offshore independent immigrants; they had "lower job satisfaction" (44% compared to 57% for offshore immigrants) and international students made "far less frequent use of formal qualifications in current work" (46% compared to 63% for offshore immigrants) (Howthorne & To, 2014, p.102). Sapeha's (2015) study revealed that "being employed and dissatisfied with a job had a strong negative effect" on the immigrant's satisfaction (Sapeha, 2015, p.905). The most worrying finding of this research was that skilled immigrants "who

do not manage to secure a job in their intended occupation within a year after arrival are less likely to do so in the future" (Sapeha, 2015, p.905).

Drolet and Kaushik (2018) recommend additional settlement support in order to "achieve a successful social and economic integration of skilled immigrants in the mainstream Canadian society" (p.8). Sapeha (2015) argues that "higher earnings and fulfilling employment" can add to a positive settlement experience (Sapeha, 2015, p.893). Sapeha warns that given the incredible human capital that international students possess, they are expected to succeed in the labor market and when that does not happen, especially for reasons such as "labor market discrimination" or finding employment that is not "commensurate with their credentials", this can negatively affect their settlement and integration (2015, p.894). According to Belkhodja, the opportunity to purse employment and permanent residency after graduation are "motivational factors" for international students to choose Canada in addition to the quality of education (2013, p. 2). However, if their transitional experiences are difficult, this could have a lasting impact on their long-term integration in Canada. Additionally, this might lead to outmigration to job markets that offer employment commensurate with their education. We might witness a gradual fall in the number of international students coming to Canada given the negative experiences of those who went before them.

Settlement services are particularly necessary as Canada has moved towards "regionalization, which aims at shifting immigration flows away from the most popular destinations" (Sapeha, 2015, p.892). In addition to the availability of employment, the attraction of immigrants to large urban centers is due to the presence of their ethno-cultural communities. Xue's review of the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada found that

"social capital" and social "networks" were the "most important source on which newcomers relied for employment problems" and this is especially true in the case of economic immigrants (2007, p. 9). Settlement support could facilitate settlement of newcomers in regions where they might not have access to ethno-cultural resources. Canada has experienced "unequal geographic distribution" of immigrants in the past and with international students as prospective immigrants, it is possible to change that. (Sapeha, 2015, p.895). International students are young and willing to embrace new cultures. With provision of settlement support, these prospective immigrants would likely be willing to settle away from large urban centers. These support services will successfully facilitate settlement and integration of newcomers to those regions.

Gates-Gasse argues that if Canada really wants to retain international students as permanent residents that "there is a need for comprehensive settlement services and supports for international students to facilitate a smooth transition towards their full integration and participation in Canadian society" (2012, p. 272). There is significant body of research that advocates for settlement services for international students who transition to work and permanent residency; however, thus far, policy makers in Canada have been cautious and slow in responding to the calls for increased settlement services to improve them. Belkhodja argues that Canada as a host country should "intervene more quickly, since the transition [to employment and permanent residency] has an impact on integration, and integration has an impact on the transition towards a feeling of belonging to the host society" **(**2013, p. 4).

Review of Best Practices

International students spend significant amount of time in Canada studying or working. This raises questions about when their integration in Canada begins. Whether integration starts during their studies or after they graduate, Belkhodja (2013) argues that our vision of the "integration continuum" determines what needs to happen by who and where (p. 15). Belkhodja identifies three levels in terms of international students' integration: the role educational institutions; "what takes place between university and community", especially the role of immigrant service agencies and finally employers' role (2013, p. 4). In addressing the barriers international students experience during their transition to work and permanent residency, we need to examine the role of post-secondary institutions and within them international student offices, the employers and the local communities as well as the role of settlement service providers and immigration authorities. The next section addresses ways of overcoming barriers to employment of international students by reviewing evidence-based practices adopted in Canada and internationally.

Post-Secondary Institutions and International Student Offices

Post-secondary institutions especially their international student offices have a significant role to play in facilitating the transition of international students to work and permanent residency. The increase in number of international students has been dramatic in the last decade and post-secondary institutions have not been able to adapt and respond to the increasing needs of international students. Lack of funding and the significant expansion of the demand for services have overwhelmed international student offices. One of the most immediate issues for post-secondary institutions to address is allocate resources to improve the experiences of international students during their studies and prepare them

for post-graduation. William (2013) in a report about international students and the role of post-secondary institutions in Nova Scotia, recommends that funding for international student offices should be increased to reflect the expansion of their services and responsibilities as well as the needs of international students (p. 50).

Scott, et al (2015) argue that policy makers should "work proactively with academic institutions and employers" to address many concerns especially the provision of "co-operative education opportunities", educating "employers about the benefits" of hiring international students and finally creating a "general feeling of belonging" for international students (p. 10). In terms of service provided by international student offices, Roach (2011) recommends two streams of services. She suggests that the first stream of immigration services for international students should be related to "temporary" status in Canada. They need services related to study and work permit, family visit and a general orientation to the immigration system in Canada (p. 25). The second stream of services should pertain to the services they need as "potential immigrants", those who wish to remain in Canada as permanent residents and "require unique immigration services" that are not within the day to day services that international student offices provide (Roach, 2011, p.26).

Gates-Gasse (2012) reports that the University of Manitoba's Student Counselling and Career Centre assists international students to make a successful transition to work after completing their studies. The center runs a semester long program for two hours every week in which international students learn about job search skills, "employment skills" and discuss "Canadian culture and workplace norms" (p.283). The authors found a similar program offered by Memorial University in Newfoundland assisting international students' transition to work (Gates-Gasse, 2012, p.285). These two cases highlight collaboration

between career centers and international student offices in combining their efforts to work with international students using all available resources in the institution. Guo and Chase (2011) discuss an initiative by the University of British Columbia to offer a course twice a year for international teaching assistants who work at the university. (p.313). The program teaches participants about "understanding the Canadian academic environment, cross-cultural communication and teaching and presentation strategies" (Guo & Chase, 2011, p.313).

The Provincial/Territorial Government

The local community including employers, civil society and local and provincial governments have significant roles to play in assisting international students to make a transition to work and ultimately to permanent residency. They can assist with successful integration of this population into the community socially and economically. There are many best practices from both Canada and other countries; however, the challenge is to promote these practices across Canada in ways that takes into consideration each region's unique needs.

Gates-Gasse (2012) discuss an initiative that Halifax Regional Development Agency designed to connect employers with international students and also to assist them to find employment (p.284). The center arranged workshops to identify what skills students needed in terms finding employment and used the findings to plan training sessions to address their needs. The third phase of the project included a networking event with employers, which was quite helpful in addressing issues of misconceptions about international students and allowed students to "practice networking skills" and learn about employers (Gates-Gasse, 2012, p.283-284). This initiative helped the business community in Halifax tap into a diverse

pool of employees while also ensuring that a young and educated population immigrates to the province permanently. In another example of best practices by local governments, Bouajram (2015) discussed a one year professional development program for international students in Australia that is "designed as a bridge to facilitate the transition from temporary to permanent" status (p.41). Through this program, students "gain structured career support, become familiar with Australian workplace culture and earn points as part of one's immigration assessment for permanent residency" (Bouajram, 2015, p. 41).

William (2013) discussed the START program in Nova Scotia, which allows international students who graduate from the province to participate in this employment program (p. 57). The program connects international students with employers and subsidizes their wages for a period of time to allow employees to gain experience and help employers cover the cost of training. The experience of employment helps international students learn about Canadian workplaces, and they also become eligible to apply for permanent residency through the Canadian Experience Class (CEC) (William, 2013, p. 57). A similar program was implemented by Newfoundland provincial government that encouraged employers to hire international students. The program was designed to "create bond between international students and rural Newfoundland" (Gates-Gasse, 2012, p.285).

Flynn and Bauder (2013) discussed the role employers play in the settlement of newcomers under PNPs, specifically in the province of Manitoba. The employers were encouraged to actively "participate in settlement process of employees as much as possible by holding diversity and inter-cultural training sessions at the workplace" (p. 9). In a similar case, employers in Kelowna, British Columbia assumed a "leading role in nominee settlements" by hiring a staff member to assist their employees with housing, completing

immigration papers and "referring them to different programs that would be useful in their settlement" process (Flynn & Bauder, 2013, p. 9).

Social inclusion and creating a sense of belonging for newcomers are central to their successful social and economic integration. Students in Badamos' study (2016) revealed that they felt "excluded from university experience" and that they could not "contribute to the Canadian society" (p. 74). The diversity of population we have in Canada is a crucial asset to utilize in order to improve settlement experiences of international students. Cox (2014) argues that we should connect international students to "social capital", referring to "social resources within immigrants' ethno-cultural or linguistics community" and provide them with "opportunities to access and interact with resources" in order to improve their settlement experiences (p.41). Gates-Gasse's study emphasizes the importance of developing social and community connections referencing the findings of a consultation forum arranged by Halifax Region Immigration Strategy in which it was revealed that 89% of international students who had "developed strong social and community roots" intended to settle in the province (2012, p. 278).

Gresham & Clayton (2011) report about an initiative in Australia that connects international students with community members by addressing "issues of inclusion and social integration", assisting the community in managing "cultural differences" and "optimizing the experience of international students through community engagement" (p. 364). Called *Community Connector Program,* it is coordinated by volunteers at the University of Newcastle. This program is promoted out of recognition that "social integration is essential to mental and emotional health, which in turn, assist in delivery of better learning outcomes (Gresham & Clayton, 2011, p. 365).

Immigration Policy Makers

Research reveals a number of measures that policy makers in Canada could adopt to facilitate the transition of international students to work and permanent residency. Collaboration with post-secondary institutions and the community, increasing funding for settlement programs and services and addressing policy issues related to work and permanent residency of international students are some of the area prioritized by recent research. Roach (2011) found in her interviews with different stakeholders that "they would like to see collaborative efforts between stakeholders such as CIC [currently renamed IRCC], post-secondary institutions, ISOs [International Student Offices], career service centers, and immigrant-serving organizations and employment service centers in the community" (p.43). University and colleges should remain involved and engaged after students graduate because they are the central point of contact for international students. Employers have an important role to play in facilitating the settlement and integration of students. Although the role of employers is "problematic and requires considerable work in terms of employee awareness", there are good practices of "mentoring, volunteering and training for the Canadian market context" (Belkhodja, 2013, p. 5). Eligibility criteria for federally funded settlement services need to include international students for essential services and until that happens immigrant serving agencies will have limited role helping these students.

Flynn & Bauder (2013) identify a "major settlement service gap" during the "period of transition when migrant workers or students possess temporary status" which can be "anywhere from eight months to two years, immigrants are not eligible to receive government-funded settlement services" (p.9). Cox (2014) argues that "CIC [currently renamed IRCC] settlement-funding model should be expanded that international students

are eligible to use immigrant settlement services" because "the long-term economic intentions for international students should position them within the qualifying boundaries for CIC-funded settlement services" (p.79). The lack of settlement services could impact the transition of international students and Belkhodja argues that "transition has an impact on integration" in the long term **(**2013, p. 4).

CHAPTER IV

Discussion and Recommendations

This chapter offers a critical analysis of the challenges international students experience when seeking employment and permanent residency in Canada. This includes a series of recommendations to address the most serious issues found in the literature review related to international students' challenges of securing skilled employment and applying for permanent residency. These challenges are serious and long-term given the negative impact on their socioeconomic integration into Canadian society. These recommendations are made in the hope of mitigating and hopefully eliminating barriers that I believe are socially and economically costly for Canadian society and its prospective immigrants.

The literature review revealed that international students experience difficulty finding skilled employment commensurate with their education. These challenges stem from lack of employment preparation programs, co-op and internship opportunities, and Canadian employers' preference for Canadian experience. Therefore, underemployment is a common experience among this group, which is costly for both the students and Canadian society. Underemployment negatively impacts their earnings and job satisfaction and these attributes are not positive indicators of sustained employment. Underemployment of

international students is also a loss for the Canadian economy because these prospective skilled immigrants are expected to fill the need for skilled labor. If they decide to improve their job satisfaction and earnings, they likely have to go back to college or university for additional qualification. This may mean they will be absent from the Canadian labor market for a few years. Additionally, both federal and provincial governments have to subsidize their education if they apply for student loan. In case, these students search employment commensurate of their qualification in other countries, that could be a long-term loss for the Canadian economy and society at large.

The challenges of securing paid skilled employment also negatively impact their eligibility for permanent residency either through the PNPs or the CEC. Additionally, applying for permanent residency is complicated by the lack of settlement support and complexities of immigration procedures. The study by Esses, et al (2018) revealed that "59% of international students who expressed plan to apply for permanent residency expected to receive institutional help to make the transition" (p.4). However, international students are not eligible for federally funded settlement support and provincially funded settlement services are limited and inadequate. International student offices at post-secondary institutions do not consider themselves responsible to provide such support, nor are they necessarily capable of doing so given their current level of resources and expertise. That leaves the Canadian employers as the only source of support; however, employers are neither capable nor responsible to provide settlement services unless there is such an agreement, which is not the case with employers in large urban centers. In many cases, international students seek the support of immigration lawyers and consultants at their own cost, which can be extremely expensive.

Assumptions about Integration

The assumption that international students will integrate smoothly into Canadian society fails to recognize that this population faces several issues and challenges. It is generally assumed that, because international students have studied and worked in Canada; are familiar with Canadian society; and speak at least one of the official languages with fluency, these individuals should not experience any issues transitioning to work and permanent residency in Canada. However, this assumption does not take into account the fact that international students require unique settlement services such as assistance in securing employment and permanent residency. Moreover, this belief does not take into consideration the limited and inconsistent settlement support available to international students. Finally, this assumption does not recognize that these young individuals with minimal life experience encounter significant and life changing decisions.

Need for Closer Collaboration

The three main stakeholders, Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (IRCC), the provincial and territorial governments and post-secondary institutions should work more closely and collaboratively. With unique responsibilities and shared objectives, each stakeholder has a crucial role to play assisting international students in Canada. There is need for regional working committees with members from the three principal stakeholders that meets regularly to discuss issues related to international students in their regions. This process will identify issues specific to each region that concern all three stakeholders. Consistent dialogue between these stakeholders is crucially important. For instance, post-secondary institutions need to regularly communicate issues, trends and concerns related to employment programs and permanent residency to federal and provincial policy makers to

better inform policy and programs related to international students' employment and retention.

Federal Funding of a Pilot Project to Offer Settlement Services

The pilot funding of settlement services at post-secondary institutions by the federal government could serve two important objectives: ensure successful transition to employment and permanent residency, and make the application process accessible to all students. Post-secondary institutions and their international student offices should receive federal government funding to provide settlement support to international students who commits to seeking permanent residency in Canada. Although the number of international students has increased dramatically over the last decade, post-secondary institutions have not been able to adapt to the increasing needs of international students. The lack of funding, expertise, and specialized services overwhelm international student offices. The current level of immigration support provided by post-secondary institutions proves to be inefficient and inadequate. Therefore, these supports must grow to ensure the successful transition of international students to employment and permanent residency. Since international student offices are well positioned to provide settlement services to this population, these offices must be better equipped to assist international students who wish seek permanent residency in Canada.

International students' offices are the focal point of contact for international students and these offices have developed expertise in offering services to assist students with work permits. These offices should receive additional funding support to expand their services assisting international students seek permanent residency in Canada. The offices should also receive more funding to hire adequate number of staff and be able to afford services at an

appropriate ratio. Williams (2013) recommended "at least one international advisor for every 300 international students" to the Nova Scotia government in order to improve the level of services these students need (p.50). Although immigrant service provider organizations have expertise in settlement and integration of newcomers to Canada, international student offices at post-secondary institutions have already developed a cliental relationship with these students over many years. Therefore, they are well positioned to provide the necessary settlement services to international students. Additionally, the settlement needs of international students are predominantly employment related and their needs for other type of settlement services are minimal.

The availability of settlement support will make the application for permanent residency more accessible to all international students regardless of their personal financial means. The current permanent residency application requirements for international students in Canada make the process inaccessible for students who do not have sufficient funds. According to one international student, the permanent residency process and requirements (proof of finances, English tests, medical tests, police reports, application fees, and so on) makes it affordable only to those with access to funds. Many international students experience financial stress during their studies and the need to pay those fees including paying for immigration services to apply for permanent residency further adds to their financial burden.

Offering Adequate Co-op and Internship Placements

The provincial and territorial governments and post-secondary institutions should work with industries across the economy to create additional co-op and internship placements for international students. Although lack of co-op and internship placements

also affect domestic students, the scale of the problem is much larger and serious for international students. There are many long-term social and economic benefits for such an investment. First, international students will integrate into the Canadian labor market early on while they are still students. They acquire familiarity with the Canadian workplace culture and develop professional networks considered essential for long-term integration into the economy. Second, the provinces and territories will have access to a young and Canadian educated workforce to address long-term labor shortages. Finally, this investment directly assists with long-term retention of students in those regions.

Raising Awareness among Employers

The provinces and territories should work with employers to raise awareness about international students and create more bridging programs. The provincial and territorial governments have significant roles to play in the socioeconomic integration of international students. As such, these players should raise awareness about the benefits of hiring international students as skilled and educated employees. Additionally, the provincial and municipal branches of governments must consider employment programs that provide incentives for employers to hire international students who intend to relocate to rural areas. For example, the employment of international students in rural communities can revitalize the businesses by attracting young and educated residents to the region. Furthermore, employers should increase their participation in the settlement process of their employed international students. Through this employer participation, international students are more likely to have a positive experience during their settlement as well as integrate smoothly into Canadian society.

Courses on Labor Market and Employment Preparation

The provinces and territories should work with post-secondary institutions to offer courses on Canadian labor market and employment preparation programs. International students should be encouraged to participate in employment preparation programs offered at their institutions if they wish seek employment in Canada. The fees and tuition already paid to post-secondary institutions should absorb the cost of these programs. The post-secondary institutions should also offer elective courses on the Canadian labor market and encourage international students to consider taking those courses if they intend to work in Canada.

Post-secondary institutions should also combine their available institutional resources to assist in the labor market integration of international students. For example, career services could be made available specifically to international students in order to prepare them for post-graduation and future employment. In addition to these services, post-secondary institutions should allocate additional attention and resources in order to improve the settlement experiences of these individuals. Through these adjustments, post-secondary institutions would increasingly incorporate international students in responding to their needs.

Diversifying Source Countries and Distributing Students across all Regions

Canada should diversify the student source country pool. Many traditionally source countries are emerging as recruiting countries. As source countries transition to becoming recruiting countries for international students and with regionalization of international student mobility, we are going to see reduction in the supply of international students. (Becker & Kolster 2012). Becker and Kolster (2012) claim that "regionalization of

international student mobility" would mean that increasing number of students would study "within their own region" and not necessarily seek higher education outside of their region (p.5). The diversity of international students' population contributes to social and economic prosperity of Canada in a balanced manner.

The federal government should also ensure a balanced distribution of international students in different regions of the country. International students are ideal candidates for permanent residency in regions with demographic challenges such as the Atlantic regions. Their presence in these regions address both demographic and labor market needs. Immigration, Refugee and Citizenship Canada (IRCC) should encourage international students to select Atlantic regions by diversifying and optimizing the selection criteria for permanent residency to meet demographic and labor market needs. For instance, the selection criteria for regions outside of the large urban centers should be expanded beyond the NOC 0, A and B. If students are able to secure employment in the industries prominent in those regions, their work experience should count towards the permanent residency requirement regardless of whether it meets the criteria for the three categories of occupation. Furthermore, the Express Entry system should afford more points for applicants from regions outside of large urban centers who studied or are employed in those regions.

Conclusion

In conclusion, underemployment of international students stems from many of the factors identified in this research paper; however, it is necessary to recognize regional context, source countries and their motivations when examining international students' social and economic integration in Canada. Despite international students' preference of skilled employment commensurate with their education, they ultimately accept any type of

skilled employment in order to secure permanent residency. These are among some of the consequential choices these young individuals with minimal life experience make while also dealing with challenges of living and studying in a foreign country. All stakeholders including federal and provincial governments and post-secondary institutions should help international students in their journey. Post-secondary institutions should not only assist them to successfully complete their studies, but should also prepare them to integrate into Canadian society and labor market. The provincial government and post-secondary institutions should offer adequate co-op and internship placements to effectively connect them to industries. The federal government should provide funding for settlement support to international students who commit to becoming a member of the Canadian society.

Future Research:

Future research should examine the impact of co-op and internship opportunities in labor market integration of international students in Canada. Research shows that hiring practices have evolved over the years and large percentage of jobs are filled without formal advertisement. Hiring decisions are beneficial to both employees and employers, therefore, employers tend to make those decisions based on evaluation of performance over a period of time. This reality benefits job seekers with the opportunity of a work placement.

Research should also examine labor market integration of international students across different regions and disciplines in Canada. With varying level of provincial and territorial support and unique labor market needs and challenges, it is imperative to study labor market integration of international students in each specific region. International students' experience of labor market entry varies across disciplines. Therefore, a comparative study of their performances across disciplines could identify key insights into their successes and challenges.

APPENDIX

A comparison of international and domestic students' fees and tuition in the colleges and universities in Ontario.

Universities & Colleges	Domestic Students' Fees and Tuition	International Students' Fees and Tuition	Province
Brock University	6197-6378	22094-22094	Ontario
Huron University College	6338-6338	22004-24643	Ontario
Lakehead University	5998-6267	20500-20500	Ontario
McMaster University	6329-6329 *	19238-23986 *	Ontario
Nipissing University	6055-6055	19325-19325	Ontario
Ontario College of Art & Design	6328-6389 *	18171-19167 *	Ontario
Queen's University	6385-6385	28589-33775	Ontario
Ryerson University	6319-6400	18886-25636	Ontario
Trent University	6377-6408	18029-18832	Ontario
University of Guelph	6172-6379	9730-20233	Ontario
University of Toronto (includes colleges)	6400-11520	31000-42560	Ontario

(Universities Canada, 2018)

BIBLIOGRPAHY

Altbach, P., & Knight, J. (2007). The internationalization of higher education: Motivations and realities. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 11*(3-4), 290 - 305.

Anwar, A. (2014). Canadian immigration policy: Micro and macro issues with the points-based assessment system. Canadian Ethnic Studies, 46(1), 169 - 179.

Arthur, N., & Flynn, S. (2011). Career development influences of international students who pursue permanent immigration to Canada. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance, 11*(3), 221 - 237.

Arthur, N., & Popadiuk, N. (2013). International students' views of relationship influence on career transition. *Journal of Career Development, 7*(3), 273 - 281.

Arthur, N., & Popadiuk, N. (2010). A cultural formulation approach to career counseling with international students. *Journal of Career Development, 37*(1), 423 - 440.

Badmos, M. (2016). Services and programming provided by post-secondary institutions for international students: Experiences of select female students from Nigeria. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Baglay, S. (2012). Provincial nominee programs: A note on policy implications and future research needs. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 13*(1), 121 - 141.

Becker, R. & Kolster, R. (2012). International students recruitment: policies and developments in selected countries. *Nuffic,* 1 - 103.

Belkhodja, C. (2013). Improving the assessment of international students' contribution to Canadian society. Pathways to Prosperity 1 - 27.

Bouajram, R. F. (2015). Recruitment to retention: Post-graduation adaptation of international students. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Canada Bureau of International Education (2018). Facts and Figures. Retrieved from: https://cbie.ca/international-students-surpass-2022-goal/

Canada Bureau of International Education (2017). Facts and Figures. Retrieved from: http://cbie.ca/media/facts-and-figures/

Canada Bureau of International Education (2016). Facts and Figures. Retrieved from: http://net.cbie.ca/download/World-of-Learning-2016-EN.pdf

Chiou, B. (2017). Two-step migration: A comparison of Australia's and new Zealand's policy development between 1998 and 2010. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal, 26*(1), 84 - 107.

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2018). Transition from Temporary Resident to Permanent Resident Status. Retrieved from: https://open.canada.ca/data/en/dataset/1b026aab-edb3-4d5d-8231-270a09ed4e82

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2017). Annual Report to Parliament on Immigration. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/corporate/publications-manuals/annual-report-parliament-immigration-2017.html

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2017). An Overview of Changes to Express Entry. 1 – 28. Retrieved from:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.cerc.ca/resource/resmgr/central_region/IRCC_Update_on_Express_Entry.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2016). Express Entry Year End Report. 1 – 22. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/ircc/migration/ircc/english/pdf/pub/ee-2016-eng.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2015). Evaluation of the International Student Program. 1 – 48. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/ircc/migration/ircc/english/resources/evaluation/isp/2015/e3-2013-isp.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2014). Canadian Experience Class. Retrieved from http://www.cic.gc.ca/EnGLish/immigrate/cec/index.asp

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2014). Canada Facts and Figures: Immigrant Overview Temporary Residents. 1 - 53. Retrieved from http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/2014-Facts-Figures-Temporary.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2011). Evaluation of the International Student Program. 1 - 86. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/ircc/migration/ircc/english/pdf/research-stats/2010-eval-isp-e.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2010). Evaluation of the International Student Program. 1 - 86. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/ircc/migration/ircc/english/pdf/research-stats/2010-eval-isp-e.pdf

Cobb, Mitch H. (2012). Exploring barriers for international students transiting to labor force attachment: A case study on Prince Edward Island. Unpublished master's thesis, University of Prince Edward Island, P.E.I., Ontario.

Covell, C.L., Neiterman, E., Atanackovic, J., Owusu, Y., Bourgeault, I. L. (2015). Understanding the factors that influence the employment and retention of international students as regulated health professionals in Canada. The Study-Immigration Pathway, 1 - 47.

Cox, C. R. (2014). International students in Canada: Policies and practices for social inclusion. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Danzer, A. M., & Ulku, H. (2011). Integration, social networks and economic success of immigrants: A case study of the Turkish community in berlin. *Kyklos, 64*(3), 342 - 365.

Department of Finance (2006). Advantage Canada: Building a stronger economy for Canadians. 1 - 92. Retrieved from: https://www.fin.gc.ca/ec2006/pdf/plane.pdf

Docquier, F., & Rapoport, H. (2012). Globalization, brain drain, and development. *Journal of Economic Literature, 50*(3), 681 - 730.

Esses, V., Sutter, A., Ortiz, A., Luo, N., Cui, J., & Deacon, L. (2018). Retaining international students in Canada post-graduation: Understanding the motivations and drivers of the decision to stay. *CBIE Research in Brief, (*8), 1 - 8.

Fais, M. R. (2012). Gender influences of women international students who pursue employment and permanent immigration to Canada. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Flynn, E., & Bauder, H. (2013). The private sector, institutions of higher education, and immigrant settlement in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 16*(3), 539 - 556.

Gates-Gasse, E. (2012). International Students as Immigrants. In H. Bauder (Ed.), Immigration and settlement: Challenges, experiences, and opportunities (271 - 295). Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc.

Global Affairs Canada (2016). Economic impact of international education in Canada. Retrieved from: http://www.international.gc.ca/education/report-rapport/impact-2016/sec-2.aspx?lang=eng

Gomez, Bianca. (2017). Pursuing permanence: Former international students' trajectories to permanent residency in Canada. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Gopal, A. (2016). Visa and immigration trends: A comparative examination of international student mobility in Canada, Australia, the United Kingdom, and the United States. *Strategic Enrollment Management Quarterly, 4*(3), 130 - 141.

Gresham, R., & Clayton, V. (2011). Community connections: A program to enhance domestic and international students' educational experience. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management, 33*(4), 363 - 374.

Guo, S., & Chase, M. (2011). Internationalization of higher education: Integrating international students into Canadian academic environment. *Teaching in Higher Education, 16*(3), 305 - 318.

Hawthorne, L. (2008). Demography, migration and demand for international students. *PECC/APRU Publication Canada-Singapore, 1*(1), 1 - 24.

Hawthorne, L. (2014). Indian students and the evolution of the Study-Migration pathway in Australia. *International Migration, 52*(2), 3 - 19.

Hawthorne, L., & To, A. (2014). Australian employer response to the Study-Migration pathway: The quantitative evidence 2007-2011. *International Migration, 52*(3), 99-115.

Hou, F., & Lu, Y. (2017). International students, immigration and earnings growth: The effect of a pre-immigration host-country university education. *IZA Journal of Development and Migration, 7*(1). 5 - 30.

Huystee, V. M. (2011). A profile of foreign students who transition to permanent resident status in Atlantic *Canada* Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Canada. Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Research and Evaluation Branch, 1 - 26

Johnston, H. J. M. (1989). The voyage of the Komagata Maru: The Sikh challenge to Canada's color. University of British Columbia Press. 1 - 155.

Kaushik, V. & Drolet, J. (2018). Settlement and integration needs of skilled immigrants in Canada*. Social Science Review, 7*(76). 1 - 14.

Kelly, N. T. (2012). International students as immigrants' transition challenges and strengths of current and former students. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Kelley, N., & Trebilcock, M. J. (2010). The making of the mosaic: A history of Canadian immigration policy (2nd ed.) University of Toronto Press. 1 - 663.

Liu, J. (2016). Internationalization of higher education: Experiences of intercultural adaptation of international students in Canada. Antistasis, 6(2).

Lu, Y., Hou, F., & Statistics Canada. (2015). International students who become permanent residents in Canada Statistics Canada.1 - 8.

Lu, Y., Zong, L., & Schissel, B. (2009). To stay or return: Migration intentions of students from People's Republic of China in Saskatchewan, Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 10*(3), 283.

Mayer, M.M., Yamamura, S., Schneider, J. & Muller, A. (2012). Immigration of international students from third countries: Study by the German National Contact Point for the European Migration Network (EMN). Federal Office for Migration and Refugees, 47. 1 - 87.

Moore, H. (2008). From student to migrant: Migration narratives of international students in Canada. Unpublished master's thesis, York University, Toronto, Ontario.

Moores, L., & Popadiuk, N. (2011). Positive aspects of international student transitions: A qualitative inquiry. *Journal of College Student Development, 52*(3), 291 - 306.

Ngo, H. V., & Kawaguchi, J. (2015). The contributions of microloans to economic and social integration of skilled immigrants. *International Journal of Social Entrepreneurship and Innovation, 3*(6), 440.

Nunes, S., & Arthur, N. (2013). International students' experiences of integrating into the workforce. *Journal of Employment Counseling, 50*(1), 34 - 45.

Office of the Auditor General of Canada (2009). Selecting foreign workers under the immigration program. Retrieved from: http://www.oag-bvg.gc.ca/internet/English/parl_oag_200911_02_e_33203.html

Onk, V. B. & Joseph, M. (2017). International student recruitment techniques: A preliminary analysis. *Journal of Academic Administration in Higher Education, 13*(1), 25 - 34.

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2016). *Recruiting for success - challenges for Canada's labor migration system*. OECD Publishing. 1 - 28. Retrieved from: https://www.oecd.org/els/mig/recruiting-for-success-Canada.pdf

Paltridge, T., Mayson, S., & Schapper, J. (2012). Covering the gap: Social inclusion, international students and the role of local government. *Australian Universities' Review 54*(2), 29 - 39.

Popadiuk, N. E., & Arthur, N. M. (2014). Key relationships for international student university-to-work transitions. *Journal of Career Development, 41*(2), 122 - 140.

Prokopenko, E., & Hou, F. (2018). How temporary were Canada's temporary foreign workers? *Population and Development Review, 44*(2), 257 - 280.

Qian, Z. (2017). Experiences, challenges, and support during study and sojourning in Canada: The case of Chinese international students. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Roach, E. (2011). Service needs and gaps for international students transitioning to permanent residency in a "two-step" immigration process: A Toronto-based study. Unpublished master's thesis, Ryerson University, Toronto, Ontario.

Rynderman, J., & Flynn, C. (2016). 'we didn't bring the treasure of pharaoh': Skilled migrants' experiences of employment seeking and settling in Australia. *International Social Work, 59*(2), 268.

Sapeha, H. (2015). Explaining variations in immigrants' satisfaction with their settlement experience. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 16*(4), 891 - 910.

Scott, C., Safdar, S., Trilokekar, R. D., & Masri, A. E. (2015). International students as 'ideal immigrants' in Canada: A disconnect between policy makers' assumptions and the voices of international students. *Comparative and International Education, 43*(3), 1.

She, Q., & Wotherspoon, T. (2013). International student mobility and highly skilled migration: A comparative study of Canada, the United States, and the United Kingdom. *Springer plus, 2*(1), 1 - 14.

Shields, J., Drolet, J., Valenzuela, K. (2016). Immigrant settlement and integration services and the role of nonprofit Providers: A cross-national perspective on trends, issues and evidence. RCIS Working Paper, 1 - 62.

Singer, C. (2017). Canada's new global talent stream: All you need to know. Mondaq Business Briefing.

Smith, C. (2016). International student success. *Strategic Enrollment Management Quarterly, 4*(2), 61 - 73.

Suter, B., Jandl, M. (2008). Train and Retain: National and regional policies to promote the settlement of foreign graduates in knowledge economies. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 9*(4), 401 - 418.

Sweetman, A., & Warman, C. (2014). Former temporary foreign workers and international students as sources of permanent immigration. *Canadian Public Policy, 40*(4), 391 - 407.

Szyszlo, P. (2016). Internationalization strategies for the global knowledge society. CBIE PhD Research, 1 - 7.

Ugland, T. (2014). Canada as an inspirational model: Reforming Scandinavian immigration and integration policies. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 4*(3), 144 - 152.

Universities Canada. (2018). Tuition Fees by University. Retrieved from: https://www.univcan.ca/universities/facts-and-stats/tuition-fees-by-university/

Wade M., & Belkhodja C. (2012). Managing a New Diversity on a Small Campus: The Case of l'Université de Moncton. Critical Perspectives on International Education. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers, 181 - 196.

Wayland, S.V., & Hyman, I. (2018). Growing impact: Post-secondary international students in Toronto. A report commissioned by the intergovernmental committee for economic and labor force development in Toronto (ICE), 1 - 35.

Williams, J. (2013). International students and the future of Nova Scotia's universities Students NS.

World Education Services (2016). *The international student experience: Student happiness is key to successful recruitment and retention*. WES. 1. Retrieved from: http://wenr.wes.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/WENR-vFINAL-top-only-5.png

Xue, L. (2007). Portrait of an integration process: Difficulties encountered and resources relied on for newcomers in their first 4 years in Canada. IRCC Research and Evaluation, 201101(01E),1 - 25.

Zhou, G., & Zhang, Z. (2014). A study of the first-year international students at a Canadian university: Challenges and experiences with social integration. *Canadian and International Education, 43*(2),1 - 18.